Chalk Talks, Dissertation Defenses, Grand Rounds, Conference Talks:

Audience Management: How to handle Q&A and audience interactions during your talk

Naledi Saul. Director, OCPD

Find the slides! career.ucsf.edu/QandA

Share your thoughts! Googledoc: bit.ly/OCPDQandA

Twitter: @ucsfocpd; @naledisaul Instagram: ucsfocpd Facebook: ucsfocpd career.ucsf.edu



Our Agenda

- 1. A (new?) way to frame your experience managing your role as a presenter
- Containment strategies for managing audience engagement in each section of your presentation:
 1) introduction, 2) the presentation itself, 3) Q&A, 4) post-presentation
- 3. Strategies to respond to everyone including challenging audience members: How to ACE (Assess, Center and Engage) your talk, playing your 8 great audience cards
- 4. How to be an ally for professional civility without jeopardizing your own professional wellbeing





Two Roles

When you present, you have two roles. Expert and Shepherd.

- 1. As the Expert, you research, organize and share your knowledge
- 2. As the Shepherd, you manage participant engagement, with the goal of bringing them from point A to B (a defined learning outcome)

Three Purposes

There are 3 sincere (in scope) purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- To improve their thinking on your work
- To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you

Four Containers



2019 © The Regents of the University of Califormia. Naledi.Saul@ucsf.edu. The Manage Up Series: career.ucsf.edu/manageup



Everything else is a waste of your time

What are some of a presenter's concerns about the audience?

- I am going to be asked something I don't know the answer to and I will be embarrassed
- Someone in a senior position is going to aggressively ask me questions





Our Agenda

- 1. A (new?) way to frame your experience managing your role as a presenter
- Containment strategies for managing audience engagement in each section of your presentation:
 1) introduction, 2) the presentation itself, 3) Q&A, 4) post-presentation





Your Containers







Introductions are a time to set an expectation container around your time together: You articulate boundaries on your topic, it's scope, and even behavioral expectations

- "I'm thrilled to talk about X, and I ask that you hold questions until the end of my presentation. I promise there will be at least ten minutes for Q&A."
- "Feel free to ask me questions during my presentation."
- Lab talk/practice: "I ask that people drill down on feedback regarding on my figures and how I'm illustrating the data. Is it clear and compelling, or cluttered? Feel free to skip comments the slide design. I'm still working on that."

Imagine 3 archetypes in your audience

- intend to behave appropriately
- intend to behave appropriately and transgress
- Intend to behave inappropriately

ofessional Development

Student Academic Affairs



Hello, my name is Tony Hyman. I'm a director of Max Planck Institute in Dresden in Germany, and [I appreciate the opportunity] to talk to you today about organization of Cytoplasm.*

• Before we begin, I would like to share 2 things:

• First, X (

• Second, Y (

So one of the key questions in biology that we are all interested in is the following: How does complexity arise from molecular interactions?*

You can usually make 1-2 "expectation setting/behavioral asks" at the beginning of your talk.

- I ask that everyone hold questions until the end, and I promise to leave at least 15 minutes for Q&A.
- I realize there is a fair amount of visual data in my talk. Please note that I have numbered my slides to facilitate returning to correct place to discuss your question.
- □ I welcome questions throughout my presentation.
- I should share that that English is my 3rd language, and I might make a few grammatical errors. If these mistakes don't affect your understanding of the science, feel free to skip any language correction. If they so, please do not hesitate to ask for clarification. I will take no offence. (*Try to include this one with another expectation it can be awkward standing alone*)
- If you have to leave before my presentation ends, please note that I have included my email at the bottom of my slides. Please reach out with comments or questions if you would like to connect. (You pretty much always include this one)

*Excerpted text from Anthony Hyman (Max Planck Institute) Part 1: How does complexity arise from molecular interactions?. iBiology https://www.ibiology.org/cell-biology/cellular-organization/



Presentation Feedback Form

Introduction	Excellent \leftarrow Poor/Absent
Broad introduction	All information presented is required for listener's understanding of the research
Main research question	Clearly explained
Background	Clearly explains what others have done to set the stage for their research
Significance	Makes clear what motivates them to explore this question and potential impact
Data	
Logical flow	Logically follows the data and each interpretation is clearly justified
Methods	Clearly explains methods and how experiments allow an answer to question(s)
Results	Presents only necessary data
Clarity	Clearly explains all results figures
Repetition	Main ideas repeated throughout
Conclusion/Fut	
Inferences Impact of work	Explains what the work infers/means, competing explanations well-addressed
for the field	Clearly explained
Future research directions	Suggests what should be done next, points out new questions raised by work
Q&A	
Active listening	Pays attention to and lets questioners finish their questions
Repeating and Clarifying	Repeats the question or rephrases and clarifies it as necessary
Flaws	Gracefully acknowledges flaws or defects pointed out by questioner
Brevity	Answers are short but clear and complete
Profess	Page 1/2 Version 10/24/19. © 2017 Bill Lindstaedt, Laurence Clement, Allyson Spence Sional Development University of California, San Francisco, Office of Career and Professional Development. All Rights cademic Affairs Reserved.

eraction with au	Idience	ellent + - 3 -	→ Poor/. 2 - 1	Absent		
Eye contact	Faces audience nearly all of th time, frequent eye contact					
Body language	Open body language, appropriately animated (i.e.					
Clarity of delivery	Speaks clearly and loudly enc does not read from slides/not no noticeable disfluencies (ahm/uhm)	ugh, es,				
Pace	Pace is easy to understand (n too fast)	ot				
Jargon	All unfamiliar terms are define re-defined throughout present					
rganization						
Slide purpose	Purpose of each slide is clear the listener (Important: Title of contains premise)					
Continuity	Effective transitions between a create a continuous sequence connected ideas					
Figures	Every figure and image is clea labeled and all figures are fully explained by the presenter					
Visuals	Majority of presentation is figures/visual aids instead of t	ext				
ummary Evalua	tion	Strongly Agree	Agree	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Don't know Can't assess
can repeat the main o ddressing with their re Ise.	question the presenter is esearch talk to someone					
Vhat is the main q	uestion?					
am convinced that the	e work is significant in the					
am convinced that th ppropriately methodo juestion(s).						
agree with the presen	ter's conclusions.					
was excited by the po	otential impact of this work.					
he speaker convinced ritically about their wo	d me that they can think					

Practicing your talk?

You can also contain people's comments with a presentation feedback form.

This feedback form is to help me get comprehensive feedback on my presentation.

Ed, since you the most familiar with my research – please ask the questions on my data and conclusion as if you are an aggressive listener.

> fice of Career & Professional Development

Student Academic Affairs

Hey! You can find this presentation resource on the Manage Up page, under the Handling Q&A workshop! https://career.ucsf.edu/QandA

	Cha	alk Talk Feedback	Form	Oct. 30, 2017		Cha	alk Talk Fe	edback	Form		Oct. 30, 20
	Excellent	Needs	Poor	Absent		Excellent	Need improve	-	Poor		Absent
Introduction		mprorentent			2nd maj	jor project (or major theme)				2	
Introduction					Aims	Reviews 3-5 specific aims					
Broad introduction Past	General explanation of overall program and importance of research	+		+	Fundability	Plan is feasible and could get funding through proposed granting agency (ex: NIH)					
accomplish- ments	Clearly and succinctly summarized				Scientific vision	Demonstrates independent thinking and planning		+		+	
Research vision	Overall plan summary/aims for the next 5-10 years	++		+	Discovery	Demonstrates excitement for science and research plan					
Timeline and staffing	Clearly describes timing and staffing requirements for first 2-3 major projects				Future collaboration	Describes research vision that provides opportunities for collaboration with current faculty					
1st major pr	oject (ex: R01)				Evidence of teaching potential Challenging	experts and non-experts in field		+			
Aims	Reviews 3-5 specific aims	++		+	questions	defensive when asked challenging questions					
Fundability	Plan is feasible and could get funding through proposed granting agency (ex: NIH)	+			Improvisatio	Demonstrates ability to think on their feet when asked challenging questions					
Scientific vision	Demonstrates independent thinking and planning	+			Summan	y Evaluation	Stron		Disagree	Strongly	Don't know
Discovery	Demonstrates excitement for science and research plan	+				the main question the presenter is	Agr	e		Disagree	Can't asses
Future collaboration	Describes research vision that provides opportunities for collaboration with current faculty				addressing	with their research talk to someone element of the someone element o	e.				
Evidence of teaching potential	Ideas communicated at a level understandable by both experts and non-experts in field				I am able to	ced that the work is significant in the f					
Challenging questions	Keeps cool and does not get defensive when asked challenging questions				I was excite colleague.	scientific community care about this v d by the possibility of this presenter as		_			
Improvisation	Demonstrates ability to think on their feet when asked challenging questions	+		├ ───┤		d by the potential impact of this work. ion between the presenter's vision and as clear.	I their				
					I am convin	ced of the potential fundability of this	vork.				

Practicing your talk?

You can also contain people's comments with a presentation feedback form.

This feedback form is to help me get comprehensive feedback on my presentation.

Ed, since you the most familiar with my research – please ask the questions on my data and conclusion as if you are an aggressive listener.

Office of Career & Professional Development Student Academic Affairs

Hey! You can find this chalk talk resource on the Manage Up page, under the Handling Q&A workshop! https://career.ucsf.edu/QandA

Containment Strategies During Your Introduction The Magic of Props!



Signaling!

Consider what materials will help you during your presentation. Reveal them during your introduction.



Hello, my name is Tony Hyman. I'm a director of Max Planck Institute in Dresden in Germany, and [I appreciate the opportunity] to talk to you today about organization of Cytoplasm.*

• Before we begin, I would like to share 2 things:

• First, X (

• Second, Y (

So one of the key questions in biology that we are all interested in is the following: How does complexity arise from molecular interactions?*

You can usually make 1-2 "expectation setting/behavioral asks" at the beginning of your talk.

- I ask that everyone hold questions until the end, and I promise to leave at least 15 minutes for Q&A.
- I realize there is a fair amount of visual data in my talk. Please note that I have numbered my slides to facilitate returning to correct place to discuss your question.
- □ I welcome questions throughout my presentation.
- I should share that that English is my 3rd language, and I might make a few grammatical errors. If these mistakes don't affect your understanding of the science, feel free to skip any language correction. If they so, please do not hesitate to ask for clarification. I will take no offence. (Try to include this one with another expectation it can be awkward standing alone)
- If you have to leave before my presentation ends, please note that I have included my email at the bottom of my slides. Please reach out with comments or questions if you would like to connect. (You pretty much always include this one)

*Excerpted text from Anthony Hyman (Max Planck Institute) Part 1: How does complexity arise from molecular interactions?. iBiology https://www.ibiology.org/cell-biology/cellular-organization/



A.

B.

Office of Career & Professional Development Rudent Academic Affairs

13 2019 © The Regents of the University of Califormia. Naledi.Saul@ucsf.edu. The Manage Up Series: career.ucsf.edu/manageup

Your Turn!

Consider your last – or next presentation.

- Is there an expectation you would consider setting? How do you want people to engage you?
- How will you verbalize that in your introduction?

Containment Strategies During Your Presentation

Your Containers

The Introduction	The Presentation	Q & A	Post Presentation
Set expectations	Tell your story	Clarify your story	Build relationships
 Decide what expectations you might want to establish (and be able to depending on the forum) in your introduction. 			
 Consider what materials – notebooks, etc. will help you manage your presentation and reveal them during your intro. 			



Containment Strategies During Your Presentation

Your Turn: Practice containing with DRE



Whenever someone asks a question

tudent Academic Affairs

DURING YOUR PRESENTATION

there are only **3** options...

15 2019 © The Regents of the University of Califormia. Naledi.Saul@ucsf.edu. The Manage Up Series: career.ucsf.edu/manageup

Containment Strategies During Q & A

Your Containers

		-	
Set expectations	Tell your story	Clarify your story	Build relationships
1. Decide what expectations you might want to establish (and be able to depending on the forum) in your introduction.1. D2. R	Dr. DRE elay: They hold their question etain: You hold their question ngage: You answer now		



Our Agenda

- 1. A (new?) way to frame your experience managing your role as a presenter
- Containment strategies for managing audience engagement in each section of your presentation:
 1) introduction, 2) the presentation itself, 3) Q&A, 4) post-presentation
- 3. Strategies to respond to everyone including challenging audience members: How to ACE (Assess, Center and Engage) your talk, playing your 8 great audience cards





Containment Strategies During Q&A:

"ACE" every engagement with your audience





1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you



1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

	Well crafted Skillful	Poorly crafted Unskillful
Sincere	ACKNOWLEDGE it to your audience	
	Unicorns!	
Insincere		

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you

Everything else is a waste of your time

GO



1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you

Everything else is a waste of your time

GO

	Well crafted Skillful	Poorly crafted Unskillful
Sincere	ACKNOWLEDGE it to your audience	INQUIRE & REFRAME it for your audience
	Unicorns!	Pontificators & Poor Framers
Insincere		



1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you

	Well crafted Skillful	Poorly crafted Unskillful
Sincere	ACKNOWLEDGE it to your audience	INQUIRE & REFRAME it for your audience
Insincere	Unicorns!	Pontificators & Poor Framers REFRAME & EXIT it for your own wellbeing
		Bullies





1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

	Well crafted Skillful	Poorly crafted Unskillful
	ACKNOWLEDGE	INQUIRE &
	it to your audience	REFRAME
Sincere		it for your audience
	Unicorns!	Pontificators & Poor Framers
	REFRAME	REFRAME
	& EXIT	& EXIT
Insincere	it for your own	it for your own
	wellbeing	wellbeing
	Bullies with Skills	Bullies

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you





1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you

Well crafted Skillful	Poorly crafted Unskillful	Think back on an audience interaction – tell the
ACKNOWLEDGE it to your audience	INQUIRE & REFRAME it for your audience	person what happened, and assess: was it sincere, skillful? Did you/they have a green light or a red one?
Unicorns!	Pontificators & Poor Framers REFRAME	
& EXIT it for your own wellbeing	& EXIT it for your own wellbeing	
Bullies with Skills	Bullies	



"ACE" every engagement **Q1.** I just don't understand how this is relevant or why I should be interested

Assess the situation

	Skillful	Unskillful
Sincere	ACKNOWLEDGE it to your audience	INQUIRE & REFRAME it for your audience
Insincere	REFRAME & EXIT it for your own wellbeing	REFRAME & EXIT it for your own wellbeing

When you have assessed that the person is sincere, but unskillful, It's a GO - you INQUIRE and REFRAME

- One way I hear your question is, what's the impact on this research on my field? Or in the world? Here's how I answer that.
- * Right now we can do X (grow liver stem cells and liver-like mini-organs or organoids, [but] neither of these can substitute for a liver transplant. And with limited organ donations, we get troubling statistics like the fact that 25% of patients in the U.S. die while on a liver transplant waitlist).*
- My goal is to do Y (combine bioengineered scaffolds with patient * stem cells to generate compatible functional livers. No more patients dying on waiting lists – that's the goal. In fact, no more waiting lists at all. Not for the 100,000 patients who receive organs worldwide annually. Not for the hundreds of thousands of people who need them – that's the dream).*

If the person is still near the mic/able to ask

But beyond that, was something unclear about my overall approach or specific techniques, or which potential funders/collaborators would find my work relevant and exciting? I'm happy to respond after the session as well.

Here, your goal is to clarify their thinking to get them to a better question – that you can actually answer. So you throw out a brief overview and then give them question options at the end.

*Excerpted text from: https://blog.addgene.org/designing-your-chalk-talk-for-the-academic-job-interview



GO

When you have concerns from their tone, phrasing or question that the person is insincere, it's a STOP - you REFRAME and EXIT

- One way I hear your question is, what's the impact on this * research on my field? Or in the world? Here's how I answer that.
- * Right now we can do X (grow liver stem cells and liver-like mini-organs or organoids, [but] neither of these can substitute for a liver transplant. And with limited organ donations, we get troubling statistics like the fact that 25% of patients in the U.S. die while on a liver transplant waitlist).*
 - My goal is to do Y (combine bioengineered scaffolds with patient stem cells to generate compatible functional livers. No more patients dying on waiting lists – that's the goal. In fact, no more waiting lists at all. Not for the 100,000 patients who receive organs worldwide annually. Not for the hundreds of thousands of people who need them – that's the dream).*

Thank you for your question.

Here, your goal is to exit the conversation. Note the speaker answers a question, but doesn't invite further exchange with a question of their own. If the person is sincere, (or insincere!) it will become clearer in how they frame subsequent interactions.



1. Assess the situation

- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

Three Purposes

There are 3 'sincere' purposes of Q&A or any audience engagement

- 1. To improve their thinking on your work
- 2. To improve your thinking on your work
- 3. To support or elevate you





- 1. Assess the situation
- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage

What will help you center?

What do you want to embody as the speaker?



BLACK HERITAG

Thurgood Marshal



- **1.** Assess the situation
- 2. Center yourself
- 3. Engage









Professional Development

Student Academic Affairs







SPECIAL

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

INVOLVE

the Audience

INVOKE

the Audience

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

6 Common Questions & 6 Common Situations

A. IS YOUR (RESEARCH) GOAL WORTHY?

- 1. Why is this interesting? I just don't understand why your work is relevant.
- 2. This sounds like a hot new technique and all, but why is this level of interrogation necessary? What do we learn after 5 years of investment of you exploring this random enzyme/toxin/mechanism?

B. IS YOUR (*RESEARCH*) APPROACH/METHODOLOGY/DATA/ETC. SOUND?

- 3. Why didn't you do X [use this technique/use that approach/gather those data points]?
- 4. Why would you (bother) do Y [use this technique/use that approach/gather those data points] Did it yield anything of use?
- 5. Couldn't the data be interpreted as Z?

C. ARE YOU WORTHY ENOUGH TO DO THIS WORK?

6. How are you separating yourself from the current lab and others who are prominent in the field? What is unique about your approach? Who are major competitors in your field?

D. COMMON INTERACTIONS WITH YOUR AUDIENCE

- A. What to do when someone interrupts during your presentation with questions.
- B. What to do if no one asks questions/if you think your audience is lost.
- 2. What to do when there is no question but someone just pontificates. They end with, "And what do you think of that?"
- D. What to do when someone makes suggestions that you don't agree with, and you want to be agreeable.
- E. What to do when someone corrects your English.
- F. What to do when you don't know the answer to a question.



Your Card

Let them be

let them be

RIGHT

Let them be

SPECIAL

Let them be

IDENTIFY Allies in the Audience

Allies in the Audience

INVOLVE

the Audienc

INVOKE the Audience

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

32

Q1. I just don't understand how this is relevant or why I should be interested.

Pause for a moment, and look around the room, as if you are considering your answer. See if any allies step in (e.g., a chair who reframes the question, by narrowing the parameters, e.g. "One question we have for every candidate is to what funders, collaborators and types of students would be excited by your work. How would you answer that?") **(IDENTIFY ALLIES)**

- One way I hear your question is, what's the impact on this research on my field? Or in the world? Here's how I answer that. (HEARD)
- Right now we can do X (grow liver stem cells and liver-like mini-organs or organoids, [but] neither of these can substitute for a liver transplant. And with limited organ donations, we get troubling statistics like the fact that 25% of patients in the U.S. die while on a liver transplant waitlist).*
- My goal is to do Y (combine bioengineered scaffolds with patient stem cells to generate compatible functional livers. No more patients dying on waiting lists – that's the goal. In fact, no more waiting lists at all. Not for the 100,000 patients who receive organs worldwide annually. Not for the hundreds of thousands of people who need them – that's the dream).*
- If the person is still near the mic/able to ask

But beyond that, I wonder if something unclear about my overall approach or specific techniques, or which potential funders/collaborators would find my work relevant and exciting? I'm happy to respond after the session as well.

*Excerpted text from: https://blog.addgene.org/designing-your-chalk-talk-for-the-academic-job-interview



Always

redefine

the

question

Your Card Let them be

> HEARD Let them be

> > RIGHT

Let them be

SPECIAL

Let them be

NVOLVE

the Audience

NVOKE the Audience

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

33

Q2. This sounds like a hot new approach and all, but why is this level of interrogation necessary? What do we learn after 5 years of investment in you exploring this enzyme/toxin/mechanism?

- I see what you're saying. That's an important question. (HEARD, GREAT)
- Look the fact is that right now we know very little about X (how glaucoma kills neurons).
- But if we can unpack that, we can do Y (we can both figure out what makes these cells susceptible and also what the neurotoxic factor is).
- And this in turn will allow us to design A/engineer B/look more broadly at C (<u>design better predictors for</u> <u>disease severity and therapies that are designed to spare neurons rather than treating secondary symptoms</u> <u>of the disease</u>).
- In short we do D (we get in front of the disease, and we get earlier interventions for the estimated 64 million people living with glaucoma worldwide. We improve the quality of life for the 112 million people who are expected to be living with glaucoma by 2040).
- That's the prize. And that's what I will be asking NIH and NSF to invest in.



Office of Career & Professional Development

*Excerpt from Dr. Seemay Chou: OCPD Chalk Talk Demonstration. 10.16.19

So you're going to try it!

Q3. Why didn't you approach Y way, or why didn't you use Z technique?

Q4. Why did you (bother to) do X?

Q5. I interpret your data differently – how do you know that the data isn't saying Z?





Your Card Let them be HEARD Let them be RIGHT Let them be

SPECIAL

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience

NVOKE

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Q3. Why didn't you approach Y way, or why didn't you use Z technique?

- You're right. There were a lot of different ways that we could do this. And I can see that using Y technique definitely would have yielded some interesting results as well. (*RIGHT*)
- Honestly, we started with NMR because that was my expertise and it's working. We've already collected data, some exciting and unexpected results taking us into new directions. And for now, since it's working, I'll continue to run with this.
 - That said, I would welcome the chance to get your advice on other approaches. I think it would be a topic of conversation in our 1:1 interview. It would be great to hear your thoughts. *(SPECIAL)*
- So...as I was saying, I...

like the best way to deflect – that your way is working*

which is



*Excerpt from Dr. Seemay Chou: OCPD Chalk Talk Demonstration. 10.16.19

Your Card

HEARD Let them be RIGHT

SPECIAL

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience

the Audience

LLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Q4. Why did you (bother to) do X?

- Thank you so much for asking that question, Bill. Let me go into that a little bit. I want to tell you a few things that we found by doing X that have already given us some insight into some interesting biology. (GREAT)
- Let me start by unpacking exactly what we did with X. We _____
- What we found was Y _____, which we expected.
- But we also found Z______, which was a really cool result that fell out of this because what is suggests to us is that A______ is different from what we originally assumed.
- Another thing that was particularly striking was B _____
- So we realize this work is only part of the puzzle, but we think it's promising because of C
- Thank you for that question. (GREAT)

*Excerpt from Dr. Seemay Chou: OCPD Chalk Talk Demonstration. 10.16.19



Your Card

Let them be RIGHT

Let them be

Let them be



INVOKE

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Q5. Couldn't the data be interpreted as Z?

- Absolutely, that is a great point. (GREAT)
- You're correct. From this study alone, we can't tell X. (where in the circuit the effect we measure is generated. It could be in the first synapse or the second synapse). (RIGHT)
- To distinguish between those two possibilities, we've done Y (we've gathered some preliminary data using technique Z. So far, these recordings show that the activity at the first synapse is unchanged, which suggests that the effect we see is generated in the second synapse).
- Which is why my next step is will be to flesh out this dataset in order to further test both interpretations.

If you've considered their possibility

If you've haven't considered it – think it through, and demonstrate how you would tackle the question

*

- That's an intriguing interpretation...definitely a different way of looking at the data. (GREAT)
- You're right. From this study alone, we can't tell X. (where in the circuit the effect we measure is generated. It could be in the first synapse or the second synapse). (RIGHT)
- Let me think this through with you. To distinguish between those two possibilities, I would probably first do Y (*gather some preliminary Z data using A technique*).
- If we designed the experiment B way, we could to determine C <u>(test if the recordings of the activity at the first synapse remain unchanged, which would suggest that the effect we see is generated in the second synapse</u>).

That would be worth doing. Thank you for that insight on my work. (GREAT)



37 2019 © The Regents of the University of Califormia. Naledi.Saul@ucsf.edu. The Manage Up Series: career.ucsf.edu/manageup
It's your turn! Think of your research, pick a question and try to answer using these frameworks





It's your turn! Think of your research, pick a question and try to answer using these frameworks

Q3. Why didn't you

approach Y way, or why didn't you use Z technique?

- You're right. There were a lot of different ways that we would do this. And I can see that using Y (NMR) definitely would have yielded some interesting results as well. (RIGHT)
- Honestly, we started with X technique because that was my expertise - and it's working. We've already collected some exciting and unexpected results taking us into new directions. And for now, since it's working, I'll continue to run with this.
- That said, I would welcome the chance to get your advice on other approaches. I think it would be a topic of conversation in our 1:1 interview. It would be great to hear your thoughts. (SPECIAL)
- So...as I was saying, I...

Q4. Why did you (bother to) do X?

- Thank you so much for asking that question, Bill. Let me go into that a little bit. I want to tell you a few things that we found by doing X that have already given us some insight into some interesting biology. (Let them be GREAT)
- Let me start by unpacking exactly what we did with X. We
- What we found was Y _____, which we expected.
- But we also found Z_____, which was a really cool result that fell out of this because what is suggests to us is that A______ is different from what we originally assumed
- And one thing that was particularly striking was B
- So we realize this work is only part of the puzzle, but we think it's promising because of C ______.
- Thank you for that question. (Let them be GREAT)

Q5. I interpret your data differently – how do you know that the data isn't saying Z?

- That's an intriguing interpretation...definitely a different way of looking at the data. (GREAT)
- You're right. From this study alone, we can't tell X. (where in the circuit the effect we measure is generated. It could be in the first synapse or the second synapse). (RIGHT)
- Let me think this through with you. To distinguish between those two possibilities, I would probably first to do Y (*gather some preliminary Z data using A* <u>technique</u>).
- If we designed the experiment B way, we could to determine C (test if the recordings of the activity at the first synapse remain unchanged, which would suggest that the effect we see is generated in the second synapse).
- That would be worth doing. Thank you for that insight on my work. (GREAT)



Your Card

Let them be **HEARD** Let them be **RIGHT** Let them be

SPECIAL

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience

INVOKE the Audience

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Q6. How are you separating yourself from the current lab and others who are prominent in the field. What is unique about your approach?

"I think what this field is missing is a little more intersection with biochemists and structural biology. Historically, people in microbiology have been asking questions in pathogenesis or microbial physiology and I think the time is really ripe now to start getting into some of the molecular details."

"And the reason why I decided to jump into this field is that thought I could bring that, and I think I have demonstrated that I can do that successfully and it's been very fun. And I know there is more to come."

"In terms of separating from my current advisor: That is definitely a question that we discussed explicitly, and they are very supportive. These are directions that I am taking on my own and I foresee no issues there."

(And if they push you for specifics)

"My PI's expertise is in X (*microbial genetics*), and I'm running with the more mechanistic work. So I'm moving in a new direction."*

Office of Career & Professional Development

There

usually aren't

wrappers here –

you just answer it

straight

*Excerpt from Dr. Seemay Chou: OCPD Chalk Talk Demonstration. 10.16.19

Your Card

HEARD Let them be RIGHT

Let them be

Let them be

DENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience

the Audience

LLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

41

SITUATION A. What to do when someone interrupts during your presentation with questions

Dr. DRE! Delay/Retain/Engage: RETAINING STRATEGIES Version 1

- Your question is a good one, and fortunately, I happen to be covering that during my methods section."
- (later, when you do answer their question)...this is what the person in this section (wave hand in the general area the person was sitting in) was asking (GREAT)

Version 2

- "That is a very specific and thought provoking question, and one that would take 20 minutes sufficiently delve into. (SPECIAL)
- Out of respect for the larger audience who might be here for the entire presentation, I invite you to follow up right after the presentation. I would love to talk." (INVOKE THE AUDIENCE)





Your Card

Let them be HEARD Let them be RIGHT Let them be SPECIAL

GREAT

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience

NVOKE the Audience

ILLUMINATE It for the Audience

42

Situation B. What do you do if you've lost people!

"If people aren't asking questions, or if I am seeing blank faces or sleepy eyes, or it's not clicking...I re-summarize my main points so far, going one level more basic, rather than moving on to the next part. Zooming out by one step and going back to some basic understanding of biology that everyone in the room has, in case you've lost them, should stir the pot a little bit. Something like: "Just to re-emphasize, here's why I think this is really interesting problem, and these are the approaches and this is what I'm going to figure out over the next few years and here's why this is important."

- "So to summarize where we're at before I start on my second aim..." (ILLUMINATE)
- This question of X ______ is an interesting problem because of Y ______
- In my first aim, my goal is to explore/examine/unpack Z _____
- Which brings me to my second aim, A_____

*Excerpt from Dr. Joe Bondy-Denomy, Panelist at Dr. Seemay Chou: OCPD Chalk Talk Demonstration. 10.16.19



Your Card

Let them be

et them be

Let them be

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience



ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Situation C. Someone pontificates, perhaps even using language that is dismissive. They end with, "So what do you think of that?"

Options:

- I thought I heard you say X (_____), and I would say Y (_____)* (HEARD)
- The most intriguing point out of your comments is Z/that you are pointing out A (______) (SPECIAL)
- Thank you for adding that to the conversation (GREAT)
- It sounds like you've thought a great deal about this/clearly have expertise in this area. Thank you for adding that to our conversation (GREAT...particularly if they hold some type of power)
- Thank you you've given me a lot to think about. I will follow up on X's work. Thank you for sharing this. (GREAT)
- Your comments are thought provoking. I am going to need to move on to make sure I get though what I promised today, but thank you for including that information in today's talk. If you have additional thoughts, I would welcome speaking more after my presentation. (INVOKE the audience)

Shift your gaze away from the person and towards the larger audience

• Are there any other questions or comments before we end/I discuss my next point/slide?

* Dr. Valerie Balester of Texas A&M University. The Perfect Defense: The Oral Defense of a Dissertation. youtu.be/edQv9OKvfdU



Your Card



Let them be

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience



ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Situation D. What to do when someone makes a suggestion you don't agree with, but you want to be agreeable.

- [When someone makes a suggestion you don't agree with] There are two ways to go about this. One is to argue with the person and say, "That would be a dumb experiment. The other way is to say: That's a good idea. I ought to try that.* (GREAT)
- I see what you're saying and there are some intriguing possibilities there. (HEARD, GREAT).**
 - I need to move forward with my talk but I do think that this (your chosen approach) will be feasible approach as I move forward. Thank you for suggesting it**(GREAT/SPECIAL)



Office of Career & Professional Development Student Academic Affairs

* Excerpted from https://edgeforscholars.org/qa-how-to-give-a-chalk-talk/

** Excerpted from 12/5/2013 "Dr. William Shrader. How To Give a Job Talk, and Why It's Not the Same as a Research Talk". youtu.be/IFW4hHBVvKk

Your Card

HEARD

l et them be

SPECIAL

Let them be

IDENTIFY

Allies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audienc

the Audience

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Situation E. Someone corrects your English grammar or pronunciation.

Thank you. (GREAT)

Shift your gaze away from the person and towards the larger audience

Are there any other questions or comments before we end/I discuss my next point/slide?





Your Card

HEARD Let them be RIGHT Let them be

SPECIAL

Let them be

DENTIFY

Ilies in the Audience

NVOLVE

the Audience

INVOKE

ILLUMINATE

Everything for the Audience

Situation F. What to do when you are asked a question that you don't know the answer to.

- I don't know, but that question has interesting implications. (GREAT)
- For example, if I knew the X (______), I could ascertain/do Y (______)
- Given the (time/resource/etc.) constraints that I was working with in the lab, I wasn't able to address it before, but it definitely is something that merits further exploration. (GREAT)



Office of Career & Professional Development Student Academic Affairs

Descriptions of each card

Your Card	Examples			
Let them be HEARD	Acknowledge the person's question/statement, usually by summarizing it for the audience: Let them know you hear them	NMR? It sounds like your saving/asking		
Let them be RIGHT	Acknowledge that they are right – explicitly recognize when you are agreement: Let them know you agree with them	We thought the same thing. I read that paper as well.		
Let them be SPECIAL	Acknowledge their specific expertise or status: Let them know you venerate them	 I'd like to hear (more of) your thoughts after the talk/on our 1:1s later. As this is your technique/area of expertise, I would welcome your insight. Your advice would be appreciated. We should talk! 		
Let them be GREAT	Acknowledge their effort or contribution with recognition: Let them know you appreciate them	thank you for asking it. Fantastic suggestion. Thank you for adding those excellent		
IDENTIFY Allies in the Audience	Identify individuals in the audience who seem positively inclined towards you	Scan the audience for individuals who seem to understand and agree with your points – nodding, etc. making eye contact, or involving them in some way may encourage them to speak up on your behalf.		
INVOLVE the Audience	To help engage your audience, or to put distance between you and an aggressive questioner, involve other audience members in some way - usually 'crowd sourcing' a question or asking for feedback	I seeare there others who have a similar question? How are others using this technique/tool, etc. Did others have similar concerns/perspectives? (<i>look around the room, and point to a nodding person</i>)would you care to elaborate on this point?		
INVOKE the Audience	Suggest that you need to move on out of respect for the audience – but invite later follow up	 Regrettably, I seem to be missing your point. I out of respect for the audience/I see there are other questions soI need to move on, but please feel free to follow up with me afterwards. I'd like to talk. 		
ILLUMINATE Everything for the Audience	If you sense your audience is lost - summarize your talk thus far for the audience	Before I move onto my next section, let me summarize the main points so far. In my effort to do X, I first did Y. That led to some interesting and unexpected results, particularly Z. And with that, now we turn my next point, which is A.		
$\sqrt{7}$ 2019 © The Regents of the University of	Califormia, Naledi, Saul@ucsf.edu, The Manage Up Series: career.ucsf.edu/manageup	Office of Career & Professional Development		

Student Academic Affairs

47 2019 © The Regents of the University of Califormia. Naledi.Saul@ucsf.edu. The Manage Up Series: career.ucsf.edu/manageup

Containment Strategies Post-Presentation

Your Containers



The Introduction	The Presentation	Q & A	Post Presentation
Set expectations	Tell your story	Clarify your story	Build relationships
 Decide what expectations you might want to establish (and be able to depending on the forum) in your introduction. Consider what materials – notebooks, etc. will help you manage your presentation and reveal them during your intro. 	 Be Dr. DRE 1. Delay: They hold their question 2. Retain: You hold their question 3. Engage: You answer now 	ACE Your Talk! 1. Assess the Situation: •Skillful/Unskillful? Sincere/Insincere? •Do you have a green light or a red light? 2. Center Yourself •Who do you admire? •What do you want to embody as a presenter? 3. Engage •Which combination of your 8 Cards will you play today – to make your sandwich? • The Person: Will you let them be Heard, Right, Special, Great? • The Audience: Will you: Identify allies Involve your audience Invoke your audience Illuminate everything for your audience	



Containment Strategies Post Presentation

Post presentation, you're relationship building

Have your notebook handy to take names and notes
Consider handing out a bit.ly where people can see your slides on google docs
Is someone aggressive? Someone interesting? Invoke the Audience (others waiting in line or have someone waiting for you)

- "I see other people are waiting, so I am going to have to end this here. But thank you for taking the time to speak with me."
- "Regrettably, I have to go and meet someone. But thank you for your comments."
- "I want to respect the time of the other people waiting to speak with me could I have your contact information to follow up? It would be great to keep in touch."





Containment Strategies Post-Presentation

Your Containers



The Introduction	The Presentation	Q & A	Post Presentation
Set expectations	Tell your story	Clarify your story	Build Relationships
 Decide what expectations you might want to establish (and be able to depending on the forum) in your introduction. Consider what materials – notebooks, etc. will help you manage your presentation and reveal them during your intro. 	 Be Dr. DRE 1. Delay: They hold their question 2. Retain: You hold their question 3. Engage: You answer now 	 ACE Your Talk! 1. Assess the Situation: Skillful/Unskillful? Sincere/Insincere? Do you have a green light or a red light? 2. Center Yourself Who do you admire? What do you want to embody as a presenter? 3. Engage Which combination of your 8 Cards will you play today – to make your sandwich? The Person: Will you let them be Heard, Right, Special, Great? The Audience: Will you: Identify allies Involve your audience Involve your audience Invoke your audience Illuminate everything for your audience 	 You're relationship building Have your notebook handy to take names and notes Consider handing out a bit.ly where people can see your slides on google docs Is someone aggressive? Invoke the Audience ("I see other people are waiting, so I am going to have to end this here. But thank you for taking the time to speak with me." Or, "I have to go and meet someone. But thank you for your comments.")

Our Agenda

- 1. A (new?) way to frame your experience managing your role as a presenter
- Containment strategies for managing audience engagement in each section of your presentation:
 1) introduction, 2) the presentation itself, 3) Q&A, 4) post-presentation
- 3. Strategies to respond to everyone including challenging audience members: How to ACE (Assess, Center and Engage) your talk, playing your 8 great audience cards
- 4. How to be an ally for professional civility without jeopardizing your own professional wellbeing







THE POINT? If multiple people engage, 'the will of the crowd' can push the bully to back down/make the speaker feel supported



Bonus Topic!

It's cultural/they are joking/you're being too sensitive: If they would treat Dr. Collins the same way, then okay - they are living their truth consistently. Carry on!

But if it's no – if they would not engage in eye rolling, or repeated interruptions, while you're trying to answer their question, or rapid fire questions, or ad hominem attacks, etc. if they were speaking to Dr. Collins, then they have situational awareness. They have the power and ability to treat someone in a way that meets **that person's definition of respect**.

- But it's for the good of the field. I don't have time to 'coddle' someone! If they really are concerned 'about the field', then they should attack that person's ideas in a way that the speakers/someone in the audience can't dismiss their cogent arguments about the science with a redirect to their person's poor behavior. In life, as in science, what you are trying to do is as important as how you do it.
- My field has always been this way: If there is one thing that all scientists believe, it's in evolution. The idea that their work would evolve but their workplace wouldn't is irrational, because (A) All things in nature evolve. (B) their field/conference is in nature. Therefore, (C) their field or conference will evolve.

But what about the people who say it's cultural, they're just being "honest" and I'm being 'too sensitive" or "I can't take feedback", or who say they are behaving normally for the field/conference?



Try the "Collins Test": Would they speak or behave the same way towards Dr. Francis Collins...



Their Why

The head

of NIH?

- They justify their rudeness because they feel it's their job to 'protect the field'
- They might feel your work threatens theirs, and want to check you in public
- They might want to embarrass you/ your PI
- Hurting others feels good



53

Chalk Talks, Dissertation Defenses, Grand Rounds, Conference Talks:

Audience Management: How to handle Q&A and audience interactions during your talk

Naledi Saul. Director, OCPD

Find the slides! career.ucsf.edu/QandA

Share your thoughts! Googledoc: bit.ly/OCPDQandA

Twitter: @ucsfocpd; @naledisaul Instagram: ucsfocpd Facebook: ucsfocpd career.ucsf.edu

OCPD wants to be a part of a biomedical community that is functional, productive, healthy.

Please join us by doing your (small) part to change culture. Be a friend, a colleague, a mentor, a leader.

Think of someone who might benefit from this knowledge, skill or resource, and share. SHARE. SHARE!

Career.ucsf.edu/Qand

